Presentation to the Higher Education Advisory Committee

Financial Aid Overview

Lee Andes, Asst. Director for Financial Aid
State Council of Higher Education for Virginia

July 21, 2011
Overview

• Review of Federal Policies
• Additional Federal Initiatives
• Changes in Federal Funding
• Institutional Aid Policy and Practices
• Factors Driving Financial Need
• Distribution of Financial Aid
• Defining Low and Middle Income
• Conclusions
Review of Federal Policies

• **Federal financial aid** has been a cornerstone of student aid programs since 1963, and since 1970 has comprised from 85 – 65% of total student aid awarded.

• **Institutional aid** has ranged from 10 – 20% over the same time frame.

• **Assistance from all 50 states** combines for 4 – 7% of total student aid, not including the tuition subsidy.
Review of Federal Policies

Source of Student Financial Aid
1970-2010

Source: College Board’s “2010 Trends in Student Aid”
Even with the addition of the Pell grant, federal student loans overtook total federal grants in dollars by 1981-82, and the gap has widened since.
Review of Federal Policies

Federal Student Aid by Type

Data in 2009 constant dollars.
Source: College Board’s “2010 Trends in Student Aid”
Review of Federal Policies – Pell Grant

Maximum Pell Grant as a Percentage of Average Tuition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Percentage of Tuition at Public Institutions Covered by Pell Grant</th>
<th>Percentage of Tuition at Private Institutions Covered by Pell Grant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1979-80</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006-07</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Review of Federal Policies – Pell Grant

Pell Grant as a Percentage of Tuition and Fees

- % of Avg 4-year Public College Tuition
- % of Avg 4-year Private College Tuition

Source: American Council on Education
Review of Federal Policies – Pell Grant

Pell Grant Growth: 1976-2011

Expenditures (in billions)

Recipients (in millions)

Source: American Council on Education
Review of Federal Policies – Pell Grant

Maximum Pell Grant Award Trend

Source: American Council on Education
Federal undergraduate dependent student borrowing limits:

- $5,500 for first-year students
  - No more than $3,500 subsidized
- $6,500 for second-year students
  - No more than $4,500 subsidized
- $7,500 for third year and beyond
  - No more than $5,500 subsidized

Career cap:

- Dependent student limit: $31,000
- Independent student limit: $57,500
- Graduate student limit: $138,500
Benefits

- No credit check
- Reduced interest rates
  - Subsidized loans for undergraduate students:
    - 6.0% in 2008-09
    - 5.6% in 2009-10
    - 4.5% in 2010-11
    - 3.4% in 2011-12
    - 6.8% in 2012-13
  - Unsubsidized loans: 6.8%
- Interest is tax deductible
- Federal government pays for interest on subsidized loans when borrower is enrolled at least half-time
Review of Federal Policies - Loans

- Favorable repayment terms
  - No repayment required while enrolled at least part time
  - Standard repayment of ten years
  - Graduated repayment with payment amounts starting low and increasing over time
  - Income-based repayment based on a percentage of annual income
  - Extended repayment provides up to 25 years to repay for loans in excess of $30,000
  - Deferment and forbearance options available for enrollment in higher education, economic hardships
Review of Federal Policies - Loans

Concerns

• Bachelor’s degree increases lifetime earnings in excess of $1 million, but not all earn the average.
• Students sign the promissory note not knowing what they will be able to afford.
• Loans are not dischargeable due to bankruptcy.
• Not all borrowers complete a degree.
• Effect of high levels of student debt still not fully understood.
  – According to finaid.org, the national federal and private student loan debt is now over $926 billion.
Two-year cohort default rates are relatively modest, but rising.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Cohort Default Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>4.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>5.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>6.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>7.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- In 2008, the default rate for all Virginia institutions was 5.9%
- Range for public and private non-profit colleges in Virginia: 0.0% to 15.9%

Source: US Dept. of Education
Review of Federal Policies - Loans

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Average debt</th>
<th>% with debt</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Utah</td>
<td>$12,860</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Georgia</td>
<td>$16,568</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Nevada</td>
<td>$16,742</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Wyoming</td>
<td>$17,084</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Delaware</td>
<td>$17,200</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 California</td>
<td>$17,326</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Arizona</td>
<td>$17,393</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Kentucky</td>
<td>$19,112</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Louisiana</td>
<td>$19,677</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Washington</td>
<td>$19,780</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Arkansas</td>
<td>$19,880</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Virginia</td>
<td>$19,918</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 North Carolina</td>
<td>$19,983</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 Maryland</td>
<td>$19,984</td>
<td>49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 Tennessee</td>
<td>$20,678</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 West Virginia</td>
<td>$22,054</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Average student loan debt for the Class of 2009 for all 4-year public and private non-profit institutions.

Source: Project on Student Debt, 2009 data
Simplification of the FAFSA

• Reduced number of questions

• Use of skip-logic to remove unnecessary questions based on answers the student has already provided

• Progress to date has been very successful, looking to do more

• Ongoing concern that further simplification creates less accuracy and may eventually create need for more applications
Additional Federal Initiatives

College Affordability and Transparency Center

Federal website (www.collegecost.ed.gov) lists colleges having:

– Highest/lowest tuition
– Highest/lowest tuition increases
– Highest/lowest net tuition
– Highest/lowest net tuition increases
Additional Federal Initiatives

Net Price Calculator

- National net price calculators currently available at nces.ed.gov/collegenavigator
- Institutions required to have a net price calculator on their websites by October 31, 2011
“Sticker Price” versus “Net Price”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sticker Price</th>
<th>Financial Aid</th>
<th>Net Price</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Advertised cost)</td>
<td>(Grants and scholarships)</td>
<td>(Cost to student)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Net Price can be covered by:

- Out-of-pocket and other gift aid
- Student loans and work-study (Considered “self help” forms of financial assistance)
- Other debt such as credit card or home equity
- Efficiencies and lifestyle choices
Additional Federal Initiatives

2008-09 College Navigator
Net Price Calculator

Virginia Commonwealth University:
– Cost of Attendance (In-state student) = $21,809
– Net price after gift aid = $15,907

Randolph-Macon College:
– Cost of Attendance = $39,465
– Net price after gift aid = $23,436

Provides a breakdown of net price by five income brackets
Changes in Federal Funding

Key Programs Reduced in FY11 Budget

• Pell grant year-round provision eliminated

• Supplemental Education Opportunity Grant reduced by $21.5 million (from $757.5 million base)

• Federal Work Study reduced by $2 million (from $980.5 million base)

• Federal TRIO programs reduced by $26.6 million (from $853.1 million base)

• GEAR UP reduced by $20.4 million (from $323.2 million base)
Key Programs **Eliminated** in FY11 Budget

- Leveraging Educational Assistance Partnership (LEAP): Virginia received $1.6 million in FY10 out of $63.9 million program
  - Partially funded Virginia’s College Scholarship Assistance Program (CSAP): $694,650
    - Results in 13.5% reduction to CSAP
  - Fully funded Virginia’s Higher Education Teacher Assistance Program (HETAP): $947,363

- Robert Byrd Honors Scholarship: Virginia received $1.0 million in FY10 out of $42 million program
Changes in Federal Funding

• Non-Pell discretionary funding was cut by $1.251 billion compared to FY10, a 2.7% reduction

• However, Pell discretionary increased, so there is a net increase in total ED discretionary funding

• 47 programs are reduced

• 38 programs eliminated
Changes in Federal Funding

Under Threat in FY12 Budget

- Pell grant maximum award
  - Program now running at an estimated deficit of $11 billion
  - If program funding is reduced to 2008 levels, maximum award could be reduced by as much as 60%

- College Access Challenge Grant

- Income-based repayment provisions for student loans

- In-school interest subsidies on some federal student loans
Changes in Federal Funding

Budget Deficit Talks

• Ending the subsidized student loan program could reportedly save $40 billion over 10 years

• Reports coming out on reducing Pell grant by $10 billion
Options for Controlling Pell Costs

- Reduce maximum award
- Reduce lifetime maximum eligibility
- Increase definition of full-time from 12 hours to 15 hours
- Eliminate eligibility for “less than half-time”
- Restrict eligibility to associate and baccalaureate degrees only
- Maintain award, but reduce the Expected Family Contribution required to qualify
- Set maximum income eligibility
Institutional Aid Policy and Practices

Financial Need Calculation

Institution Cost of Attendance (COA)  
less  Student’s Expected Family Contribution (EFC)  

Financial Need  

less  Financial Aid  

Unmet Need
Institutional Aid Policy and Practices

Cost of Attendance

Estimates used by institutions to determine eligibility for need-based aid. Will vary by college.
Institutional Aid Policy and Practices

Free Application for Federal Student Aid (FAFSA)
Institutional Aid Policy and Practices

FAFSA Information Collection

• Collects student data on:
  – Adjusted Gross Income for student and parents
  – Family size
  – Number in family going to college
  – Asset information
  – Family residence
  – Age of oldest parent
Federal Methodology

• Federal government uses this information to determine:
  – Available income
  – Cost of living
  – Asset protection allowance

• Numbers are plugged into a calculation to determine Expected Family Contribution (EFC)
Sample EFC Scenarios

EFCs will vary significantly based on differences in age of parent, assets, and other details.

- Family of 4 with AGI of $75,000; EFC = $7,300
- Family of 4 with AGI of $50,000; EFC = $4,000
- Family of 6 with AGI of $50,000; EFC = $2,080
Institutional Aid Policy and Practices

Financial Aid Typically Available

• Federal government
  – Pell Grant
  – Supplemental Education Opportunity Grant

• State government
  – Virginia Student Financial Assistance Program
  – Virginia Tuition Assistance Grant Program (VTAG)
  – College Scholarship Assistance Program
  – Two-Year College Transfer Grant Program

• Institution
  – Grants from tuition and fee revenue
  – Unfunded scholarships and waivers
Interaction of Programs

- Dozens of different aid programs available from federal and state government
- Once institutional & private programs are included, the number goes into the hundreds
- Each has a unique purpose and its own individual requirements
- Many need-based programs will attempt to be the “last dollar,” posing a packaging challenge
- Colleges must balance these differing missions into financial aid packages for thousands of students
Institutional Aid Policy and Practices

Awards Process

- Award students meeting the institution’s FAFSA application deadline
  - late filers are wait-listed or not awarded
- Start with basic calculation of remaining need: COA – EFC – known need-based gift aid (typically just the Pell grant) = remaining need
- Determine “neediest student” based on institutional definition: can be students with 0 EFC or students with large amounts of need
- Eligible neediest students receive VGAP of at least tuition
Institutional Aid Policy and Practices

Awards Process

• Those having greatest amount of remaining need are awarded first
• Continue until funds expire
• VSFAP awards can be based on:
  • Meeting a percentage of need
    – Typically 30-60% of need, up to tuition/fees/books
  • Slotting a standard award amount for differing levels of need
    – $4,000 for need between $8,000 and $10,000
    – $3,000 for need between $5,000 and $8,000
Institutional Aid Policy and Practices

Awards Process

• Practices vary according to two basic principles:
  - “Spreading it thick”: Provide fewer students with higher amounts of aid.
  - “Spreading it thin”: Provide smaller awards to larger numbers of students.

• Policies vary and reflect such institutional differences as the income distribution of students and availability of resources.
Institutional Aid Policy and Practices

Awards Process

- Student loans and work-study are packaged last based on federal rules
  - Some VCCS institutions do not participate in federal student loan program

- Institution’s can control borrowing by manipulating Cost of Attendance figures

- Institutions package federal loans, but it is the student’s responsibility to pursue private loans
## Sample Award Packages

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>East College</th>
<th>West College</th>
<th>North University</th>
<th>South University</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost of Attendance</strong></td>
<td>$20,483</td>
<td>$21,227</td>
<td>$18,501</td>
<td>$20,617</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Expected Family Contribution</strong></td>
<td>- $998</td>
<td>- $1,396</td>
<td>- $9,770</td>
<td>- $9,468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Federal Grants (Pell and SEOG)</strong></td>
<td>- $4,800</td>
<td>- $4,000</td>
<td>- $0</td>
<td>- $0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Financial Need</strong></td>
<td>$14,685</td>
<td>$15,831</td>
<td>$8,731</td>
<td>$11,149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Commonwealth Award</strong></td>
<td>- $5,130</td>
<td>- $4,970</td>
<td>- $1,450</td>
<td>- $3,850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outside Scholarship</strong></td>
<td>- $0</td>
<td>- $250</td>
<td>- $0</td>
<td>- $200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Remaining Need</strong></td>
<td>$9,555</td>
<td>$10,611</td>
<td>$7,281</td>
<td>$7,099</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subsidized Student Loan</strong></td>
<td>- $5,500</td>
<td>- $5,500</td>
<td>- $5,500</td>
<td>- $4,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unmet Need</strong></td>
<td>$4,055</td>
<td>$5,111</td>
<td>$1,781</td>
<td>$2,599</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Grants</strong></td>
<td>$9,930</td>
<td>$9,220</td>
<td>$1,450</td>
<td>$4,050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Loans</strong></td>
<td>$5,500</td>
<td>$5,500</td>
<td>$5,500</td>
<td>$4,500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Analysis of these Examples

• First two students are examples of $40,000 AGI, and the second two are $70,000 AGI.

• Even with significant borrowing, each of the students have Unmet Need.

• Low-income students have greater amounts of Unmet Need
  • In this case, over $4,000 each.

• Middle income rely heavily on their EFC
  • More than $9,000 each for incomes of just $70,000.
Institutional Aid Policy and Practices

- Institutional aid is used primarily for either need-based students or for specific degree programs (such as STEM)

- Some institutions combine institutional aid with federal and state to meet specific award goals

- Others use institutional aid as last aid awarded
Institutional Aid Policy and Practices

• Most institutions have internal financial aid awarding policies and strategies based on the needs of their students and available resources

• Some institutions have made public commitments as part of their management agreements:
  – UVA: Access UVA
  – W&M: Gateway
  – Virginia Tech: Funds for the Future
Factors Driving Financial Need

Increased Number of Students

- From 2008 to 2009, there was a 18.7% increase in Virginia students completing the FAFSA
- Some are new enrollments, many are returning students recognizing increased need for aid

Increased Costs

- For 2009-10, tuition & fees at public institutions went up 5.0%
- Room & board costs increased by 5.1%
- Other costs are also increasing
  - Gas prices increased about 40% in the last year
## Factors Driving Financial Need

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percent of VSFAP Funded By Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2006-07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007-08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008-09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010-11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011-12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Distribution of Financial Aid

Federal Pell Grant

2009-10 recipients by income range
Distribution of Financial Aid

Virginia Student Financial Assistance

2009-10 recipients by income range

- 0-9,999
- 10,000-19,999
- 20,000-29,999
- 30,000-39,999
- 40,000-49,999
- 50,000-59,999
- 60,000-69,999
- 70,000-79,999
- 80,000-89,999
- 90,000-99,999
- 100,000-149,999
- 150,000-199,999
- 200,000+

Two Year Public

Four Year Public
**Distribution of Financial Aid**

**Virginia Tuition Assistance Grant Program**

2009-10 recipients by income range

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Income Range</th>
<th>Number of Recipients</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-9,999</td>
<td>1,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10,000-19,999</td>
<td>1,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20,000-29,999</td>
<td>1,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30,000-39,999</td>
<td>1,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40,000-49,999</td>
<td>1,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50,000-59,999</td>
<td>1,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60,000-69,999</td>
<td>800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70,000-79,999</td>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80,000-89,999</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90,000-99,999</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100,000-149,999</td>
<td>3,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150,000-199,999</td>
<td>1,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200,000+</td>
<td>800</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Distribution of Financial Aid

Two-Year College Transfer Grant

2009-10 recipients by income range

- Four Year Public
- Four Year Private
Distribution of Financial Aid

Institutional Aid and Tuition Waivers

2009-10 recipients by income range
Distribution of Financial Aid

Distribution of All Grant Aid

2009-10 recipients by income range

- 0-9,999
- 10,000-19,999
- 20,000-29,999
- 30,000-39,999
- 40,000-49,999
- 50,000-59,999
- 60,000-69,999
- 70,000-79,999
- 80,000-89,999
- 90,000-99,999
- 100,000-149,999
- 150,000-199,999
- 200,000+

- Two Year Public
- Four Year Public
- Four Year Private
Distribution of Financial Aid

Total Aid Available for Virginia Undergraduates

- **$3.4 billion** in *federal aid* available to Virginia in FY10 (all sectors, all students)

- **$199 million** in total *state financial aid* (public and private non-profit colleges)

- **$215.8 million** in *institutional aid* (public and private non-profit colleges)
B. Consistent with the objectives of this chapter identified in § 23-38.87:10, the Advisory Committee, in consultation with and with assistance from the staff of the Council and such other assistance it may need, shall develop and review at least every five years, in consultation with the respective Chairs of the House Committees on Appropriations and Education and the Senate Committees on Finance and on Education and Health, or their designees, representatives of public institutions of higher education in the Commonwealth, and such other state officials as may be designated by the Governor:

2. Criteria for determining which families qualify as “low-income” and “middle-income” for purposes of § 23-38.87:15 and how they relate to federal, state and institutional policies governing the provision of financial assistance to students of such families;
Defining Low and Middle Income

3 Possible Approaches

1. Percent of poverty
2. Percentile of adjusted gross income
3. Percentile of EFC
Defining Low and Middle Income

Percent of poverty

• Federally calculated and annually adjusted
• Takes into account size of family, as well as income
• Already in use by the institutions for other programs
• May be more useful in describing low income than middle income
• Not a concept familiar to most middle-income families
Definitions would then be expressed as some determined percent of poverty.

Examples income-level breakpoints for various percent of poverty:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Family of 4</th>
<th>Family of 6</th>
<th>Family of 8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>100%</td>
<td>$22,350</td>
<td>$29,990</td>
<td>$37,630</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150%</td>
<td>$33,525</td>
<td>$44,985</td>
<td>$56,445</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200%</td>
<td>$44,700</td>
<td>$59,980</td>
<td>$75,260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>300%</td>
<td>$67,050</td>
<td>$89,970</td>
<td>$112,890</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Defining Low and Middle Income

Percentile of adjusted gross income

• Very flexible
  – Can be expressed by national or state levels, or by institution
• Annually adjustable
• Easily understood by most families
• Modifications may be necessary to take into account family size
If a percentile of income is used, recommend breaking down into quartiles or quintiles.

Using U.S. Census Bureau data, sample breakpoints could be:
• $0 - $34,999 for low income
• $35,000 - $99,999 for middle income

Actual breakpoints depend upon whether using:
• National, state, or institution data
• Income or AGI
• Quartiles or quintiles.
Definition Low and Middle Income

Percentile of Expected Family Contribution

- Federally calculated
- Takes into account family income, size, and other financial resources
- Can be a statewide or institution-specific measure
- Benchmark would most likely have a two-year lag
- Students wouldn’t know their individual EFC until they submit FAFSA
- Formula is subject to change in support of federal policies
Conclusions

• As costs continue to increase, we cannot count on federal grant funding to keep up

• State financial aid and federal student loan borrowing have their limits

• Institutional award policies generally support addressing students with greatest levels of need first, which are most often the low income students

• Financial aid is spread well into the middle income, but those students still rely a great deal on the EFC